

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS  
SHERMAN DIVISION**

The State of Texas, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

Google LLC,

Defendant.

Case No. 4:20-cv-00957-SDJ

Hon. Sean D. Jordan

**PLAINTIFF STATES' UNOPPOSED MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE UNDER SEAL**

The Plaintiff States (“The States”) respectfully move to seal their Reply in Support of Motion for Spoliation Sanctions (“the Motion”) and the exhibits thereto (“Exhibits”), to be filed later today. Defendant Google LLC (“Google”) does not oppose.

**I. LEGAL STANDARD**

While the “public’s right of access to judicial proceedings is fundamental” and creates a default presumption “that judicial records should not be sealed,” *Binh Hoa Le v. Exeter Fin. Corp.*, 990 F.3d 410, 418-19 (5th Cir. 2021), this right of access “is not absolute.” *Nixon v. Warner Commc’ns, Inc.*, 435 U.S. 589, 598 (1978). Courts have properly limited the public’s right of access to protect “sources of business information that might harm a litigant’s competitive standing.” *Nixon*, 435 U.S. at 598. In deciding whether to allow public access to judicial records, the Court must exercise its discretion “in light of the relevant facts and circumstances of the particular case,” balancing “the public’s common law right of access against the interests favoring nondisclosure.” *Vantage Health Plan, Inc. v. Willis-Knighton Med. Ctr.*, 913 F.3d 443, 450 (5th

Cir. 2019) (quoting *Nixon*, 435 U.S. at 599, and *S.E.C. v. Van Waeyenberghe*, 990 F.2d 845, 848 (5th Cir. 1993)).

## **II. ARGUMENT**

The States, with Google’s consent, request to file under seal their Reply in Support of Motion for Spoliation Sanctions and all exhibits attached thereto because they contain references to documents and depositions that Google has stated contained non-public, highly sensitive commercial information that, if disclosed publicly, may cause Google competitive harm. Examples of such documents include depositions, documents, and data produced in this case as Confidential and/or Highly Confidential – Attorneys’ Eyes Only.

Courts routinely recognize that the interest in nondisclosure of sensitive commercial information outweighs the public’s right of access to court records. *See, e.g., Nixon*, 435 U.S. at 598 (“[C]ourts have refused to permit their files to serve . . . as sources of business information that might harm a litigant’s competitive standing.”).

Here, the States’ Motion and Exhibits contain data including the use of chat communications, specific communications by Google employees and executives, internal data from Google, and depositions pertaining thereto. The States’ Motion and Exhibits further contain expert declarations describing such documents and depositions.

Consistent with Local Rule CV-5, if permitted to file the Motion and Exhibits under seal, the States will work with Google to file a redacted version—with as limited reductions as possible—of the above-referenced documents within seven (7) days.

## **III. CONCLUSION**

For these reasons, the States respectfully move the Court for an order to file under seal the Motion and Exhibits.

DATED: January 13, 2025

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ W. Mark Lanier

W. Mark Lanier

[Mark.Lanier@LanierLawFirm.com](mailto:Mark.Lanier@LanierLawFirm.com)

Alex J. Brown

[Alex.Brown@LanierLawFirm.com](mailto:Alex.Brown@LanierLawFirm.com)

Zeke DeRose III

[Zeke.Derose@LanierLawFirm.com](mailto:Zeke.Derose@LanierLawFirm.com)

Jonathan P. Wilkerson

[Jonathan.Wilkerson@LanierLawFirm.com](mailto:Jonathan.Wilkerson@LanierLawFirm.com)

10940 W. Sam Houston Pkwy N.

Suite 100

Houston, TX 77064

(713) 659-5200

**THE LANIER LAW FIRM, PLLC**

*Counsel for Texas, Idaho, Louisiana (The Lanier Law Firm only), Indiana, Mississippi, North Dakota, South Carolina, and South Dakota  
Submitted on behalf of all Plaintiff States*

/s/ Ashley Keller

Ashley Keller

[ack@kellerpostman.com](mailto:ack@kellerpostman.com)

Kiran N. Bhat

[kiran.bhat@kellerpostman.com](mailto:kiran.bhat@kellerpostman.com)

2333 Ponce De Leon Boulevard

Suite R-240

Coral Gables, Florida 33134

(833) 633-0118

Zina Bash (Bar No. 24067505)

[zina.bash@kellerpostman.com](mailto:zina.bash@kellerpostman.com)

111 Congress Avenue, Suite 500

Austin, TX 78701

(512) 690-0990

/s/ Noah S. Heinz

Noah S. Heinz

[noah.heinz@kellerpostman.com](mailto:noah.heinz@kellerpostman.com)

1101 Connecticut Ave., N.W., Suite 1100

Washington, DC 20036

(202) 918-1123

**KELLER POSTMAN LLC**

**NORTON ROSE FULBRIGHT US LLP**

Joseph M. Graham, Jr.

[joseph.graham@nortonrosefulbright.com](mailto:joseph.graham@nortonrosefulbright.com)

Geraldine Young

[geraldine.young@nortonrosefulbright.com](mailto:geraldine.young@nortonrosefulbright.com)

1550 Lamar Street, Suite 2000

Houston, Texas 77010

(713) 651-5151

/s/ Marc B. Collier

[Marc.Collier@nortonrosefulbright.com](mailto:Marc.Collier@nortonrosefulbright.com)

98 San Jacinto Blvd., Suite 1100

Austin, Texas 78701

(512) 474-5201

FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF TEXAS

KEN PAXTON

Attorney General

/s/ James R. Lloyd

Brent Webster, First Assistant Attorney General of Texas

[Brent.Webster@oag.texas.gov](mailto:Brent.Webster@oag.texas.gov)

James R. Lloyd, Deputy Attorney General for Civil Litigation

[James.Lloyd@oag.texas.gov](mailto:James.Lloyd@oag.texas.gov)

**STATE OF TEXAS, OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL**

P.O. Box 12548

Austin, TX 78711-2548

(512) 936-1674

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Texas*

FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF ALASKA:

TREG TAYLOR  
ATTORNEY GENERAL

By: /s/ Jeff Pickett

Jeff Pickett

Senior Assistant Attorney General, Special Litigation Section

jeff.pickett@alaska.gov

*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Alaska*

FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF ARKANSAS:

TIM GRIFFIN  
ATTORNEY GENERAL

By: 

AMANDA J. WENTZ

Ark. Bar No. 2021066

Assistant Attorney General

Office of the Arkansas Attorney General

323 Center Street, Suite 200

Little Rock, AR 72201

(501) 682-1178

Amanda.Wentz@ArkansasAG.gov

*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Arkansas*

FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF FLORIDA:

ASHLEY MOODY, Attorney General

/s/ Lee Istrail

LEE ISTRAIL, Assistant Attorney General  
FL Bar No. 119216

LIZABETH A. BRADY, Director, Antitrust Division  
R. SCOTT PALMER, Special Counsel and Chief of Complex Enforcement  
ANDREW BUTLER, Assistant Attorney General  
CHRISTOPHER KNIGHT, Assistant Attorney General

Office of the Attorney General, State of Florida  
PL-01 The Capitol  
Tallahassee, Florida 32399  
Phone: 850-414-3300  
Email: [scott.palmer@myfloridalegal.com](mailto:scott.palmer@myfloridalegal.com)

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Florida*

FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF IDAHO:

RAÚL R. LABRADOR  
Attorney General

/s/ John K. Olson

John K. Olson, Deputy Attorney General

Consumer Protection Division  
Office of the Attorney General  
954 W. Jefferson Street, 2nd Floor  
P.O. Box 83720  
Boise, Idaho 83720-0010  
Telephone: (208) 334-2424  
john.olson@ag.idaho.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Idaho*



FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF INDIANA:

THEODORE E. ROKITA  
Attorney General

/s/ Jesse J. Moore

Jesse J. Moore  
Deputy Attorney General – Consumer Litigation  
302 W. Washington St.  
IGCS - 5th Floor  
Indianapolis, IN 46204-2770  
Phone: (317) 234-1479  
Fax: (317) 232-7979  
Email: jesse.moore@atg.in.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Indiana*

FOR PLAINTIFF COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY:

RUSSELL COLEMAN  
Attorney General

/s/ Philip R. Heleringer

Christian J. Lewis, Commissioner of the Office of Consumer Protection  
christian.lewis@ky.gov

Philip R. Heleringer, Executive Director of the Office of Consumer Protection  
philip.heleringer@ky.gov

Jonathan E. Farmer, Deputy Executive Director of the Office of Consumer Protection  
jonathan.farmer@ky.gov

Office of the Attorney General

Commonwealth of Kentucky

1024 Capital Center Drive, Suite 200

Frankfort, Kentucky 40601

Tel: 502-696-5300

*Attorneys for Plaintiff Commonwealth of Kentucky*

FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF LOUISIANA:

By: /s/ Patrick Voelker  
Liz Murrill, Attorney General  
Michael Dupree, Assistant Attorney General  
Patrick Voelker, Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the Attorney General, State of Louisiana  
Public Protection Division  
1885 North Third St.  
Baton Rouge, Louisiana 70802  
(225) 326-6400  
voelkerp@ag.louisiana.gov

s/ James R. Dugan, II  
James R. Dugan, II (*pro hac vice*)  
TerriAnne Benedetto (*pro hac vice*)  
The Dugan Law Firm  
365 Canal Street  
One Canal Place, Suite 1000  
New Orleans, LA 70130  
PH: (504) 648-0180  
FX: (504) 649-0181  
EM: jdugan@dugan-lawfirm.com  
tbenedetto@dugan-lawfirm.com

James Williams  
CHEHARDY SHERMAN WILLIAM, LLP  
Galleria Boulevard, Suite 1100  
Metairie, LA 70001  
PH: (504) 833-5600  
FX: (504) 833-8080  
EM: jmw@chehardy.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Louisiana*

FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF MISSISSIPPI:

LYNN FITCH, ATTORNEY GENERAL  
STATE OF MISSISSIPPI

By: /s/ Garrett S. Mascagni  
Garrett S. Mascagni  
Special Assistant Attorney General  
Consumer Protection Division  
Mississippi Attorney General's Office  
Post Office Box 220  
Jackson, Mississippi 39205  
Telephone: 601-359-4223  
Fax: 601-359-4231  
Garrett.Mascagni@ago.ms.gov

*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Mississippi*

FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF MISSOURI:

ANDREW BAILEY

Attorney General

/s/ Michael Schwalbert

Michael.Schwalbert@ago.mo.gov

Missouri Attorney General's

Office

815 Olive St.

Suite 200

St. Louis, MO 63101

Tel: 314-340-7888

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Missouri*

FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF MONTANA:

AUSTIN KNUDSEN  
Montana Attorney General

/s/ Anna Schneider

Anna Schneider  
Montana Attorney General's Office  
P.O. Box 200151  
Helena, MT 59620-0151  
Phone: (406) 444-4500  
Fax: (406) 442-1894 Anna.Schneider@mt.gov

/s/ Charles J. Cooper

Charles J. Cooper  
ccooper@cooperkirk.com  
David H. Thompson  
dthompson@cooperkirk.com  
Brian W. Barnes  
bbarnes@cooperkirk.com  
Harold S. Reeves  
hreeves@cooperkirk.com  
COOPER & KIRK PLLC  
1523 New Hampshire Avenue, NW  
Washington DC 20036  
Phone: (202) 220-9620  
Fax: (202) 220-9601

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Montana*

FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF NEVADA:

AARON D. FORD  
Attorney General  
ERNEST D. FIGUEROA  
Consumer Advocate

*/s/ Michelle C. Badorine*

---

Michelle C. Badorine, Senior Deputy  
Attorney General  
MNewman@ag.nv.gov  
Lucas J. Tucker (NV Bar No. 10252)  
Senior Deputy Attorney General  
LTucker@ag.nv.gov  
Office of the Nevada Attorney General  
100 N. Carson St.  
Carson City, Nevada 89701  
Tel: (775) 684-1100

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Nevada*

FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF NORTH DAKOTA:

**STATE OF NORTH DAKOTA**

Drew H. Wrigley

Attorney General

By: /s/ Elin S. Alm

Elin S. Alm, ND ID 05924

Assistant Attorneys General

Consumer Protection & Antitrust Division

Office of Attorney General of North Dakota

1720 Burlington Drive, Suite C, Bismarck, ND 58503-7736

(701) 328-5570

(701) 328-5568 (fax)

ealm@nd.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of North Dakota*



FOR PLAINTIFF COMMONWEALTH OF PUERTO RICO:

/s/ Domingo Emanuelli-Hernández

Domingo Emanuelli-  
Hernández Attorney General  
Thaizza Rodríguez Pagán  
Assistant Attorney  
General PR Bar No.  
17177  
P.O. Box 9020192  
San Juan, Puerto Rico 00902-0192  
Tel: (787) 721-2900, ext. 1201, 1204  
trodriguez@justicia.pr.gov

Kyle G. Bates  
HAUSFELD LLP  
600 Montgomery Street, Suite 3200  
San Francisco, CA 94111

*Attorneys for Plaintiff Commonwealth of Puerto Rico*

FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA:

ALAN WILSON  
Attorney General

/s/ Mary Frances Jowers

Mary Frances Jowers  
Assistant Deputy Attorney General  
W. Jeffrey Young  
Chief Deputy Attorney General  
C. Havird Jones, Jr.  
Senior Assistant Deputy Attorney General  
South Carolina Attorney General's Office  
P.O. Box 11549  
Columbia, South Carolina 29211-1549  
Phone: 803-734-5855  
Email: mjowers@scag.gov

Charlie Condon  
Charlie Condon Law Firm, LLC  
880 Johnnie Dodds Blvd, Suite 1  
Mount Pleasant, SC 29464  
Phone: 843-884-8146  
Email: charlie@charliecondon.com

James R. Dugan, II (*pro hac vice*)  
The Dugan Law Firm  
365 Canal Street  
One Canal Place, Suite 1000  
New Orleans, LA 70130  
Phone: (504) 648-0180  
Email: jdugan@dugan-lawfirm.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of South Carolina*

FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF SOUTH DAKOTA:

MARTY JACKLEY  
Attorney General

/s/ Jonathan Van Patten

Jonathan Van Patten  
Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the Attorney General  
1302 E. Highway 14, Suite 1  
Pierre, SD 57501  
Tel: 605-773-3215  
jonathan.vanpatten@state.sd.us

*Attorney for Plaintiff State of South Dakota*

FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF UTAH:

Derek E. Brown  
Utah Attorney General

/s/ Matthew Michaloski

Matthew Michaloski  
Marie W.L. Martin  
Assistant Attorney General  
160 East 300 South, 5th Floor  
P.O. Box 140811  
Salt Lake City, UT 84114  
[mmichaloski@agutah.gov](mailto:mmichaloski@agutah.gov)  
Telephone: (801) 440-9825

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Utah and  
as counsel for the Utah Division of Consumer Protection*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE AND SEALING**

I certify that, on January 13, 2025, this document was filed electronically in compliance with Local Rule CV-5(a) and served on all counsel who have consented to electronic service, per Local Rule CV-5(a)(3)(A).

/s/ Marc B. Collier  
Marc B. Collier

**CERTIFICATE OF CONFERENCE**

I certify that counsel has complied with the meet and confer requirement in Local Rule CV-7(h), and that this motion is unopposed.

/s/ Marc B. Collier  
Marc B. Collier